Stoddard accepted the offer, and relocated to Northampton in 1670. Within a few months, Stoddard had married Mather's widow, Esther Warham, moved into his house, and took over his pulpit to become Northampton's second minister. He held the post for 55 years, and he and Esther produced thirteen children.

Stoddard's concepts of theology were not widely accepted either by fellow clergy or laymen, in New England. As Stoddard felt the ministry was key in bringing people to the Lord, his main goal, was converting the hearts of sinners. Therefore one assumes that Stoddard's popularity and influence in New England stems from his personality, rather than his theology. Stoddard's position was expressed through debates with Cotton and Increase Mather.